


| | SUBMISSION | TITLE | JOURNAL | STATUS | CHARGES |
|---|------------|---------------------------|---|----------|---------|
|  | 230456671 | Biowaste-derived oxyge... | Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and... | Accepted | |

1 SUBMISSION 

 PEER REVIEW 



16 February 2023 **With Editor**

17 February 2023 **Out for Review**

01 March 2023 **Decision Pending**

[Help and Info](#)

[Connect with us](#)

01 March 2023 **Revision Required**
[Contact Us](#)
[Accessibility](#)



27 March 2023 **Revision Incomplete**

[Privacy Policy](#)

[Cookies Policy](#)

[Terms & Conditions](#)

27 March 2023 **Revised Manuscript Submitted**

27 March 2023 **With Journal Administrator**

31 March 2023 **With Editor**

24 April 2023 **Out for Review**

28 April 2023 **Decision Pending**

28 April 2023 **Revision Required**

12 May 2023 **Revision Incomplete**

12 May 2023 **Revised Manuscript Submitted**

12 May 2023 **With Journal Administrator**

12 May 2023 **With Editor**

12 May 2023 **Out for Review**

13 May 2023 **Decision Pending**



13 May 2023 **Accepted**

Feedback



3

PRODUCTION



230456671 (Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects) A revise decision has been made on your submission5 messages

Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

Thu, Mar 2, 2023 at 12:44 AM

Reply-To: snizetic@fesb.hr

To: arung-lolo@fmipa.unhas.ac.id

01-Mar-2023

Dear Dr Bidayatul Armynah:

Your manuscript entitled "Biowaste-derived oxygen-self-doped three-dimensional interconnected porous carbon for electrochemical supercapacitor applications" which you submitted to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects, has been reviewed. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) would like to see some revisions made to your manuscript before publication. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

When you revise your manuscript please highlight the changes you make in the manuscript by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or colored text.

In accordance with our format-free submission policy, an editable version of the article must be supplied at the revision stage. Please submit your revised manuscript files in an editable file format.

When you submit your revision, please also provide your response to the reviewer comments as a separate "Supplementary Material - for review" source file.

To submit a revision, go to <https://rp.tandfonline.com/submission/flow?submissionId=230456671&step=1>. If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

If you have any questions or technical issues, please contact the journal's editorial office at ueso-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon by 29-Jun-2023. Please contact our editorial office at ueso-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk if you are in need of an extension.

Changing the author list for a revision is rare and requires two criteria be met. First, every author being added or removed must provide their agreement for the change. Second, each author who is being added must also explain why they meet the definition of authorship for this paper in detail and elaborate on specific areas of the research they contributed to. This definition is given at <https://authorservices.taylorandfrancis.com/defining-authorship/>. Any requested changes in the order of the author list also require the agreement of all authors and an explanation of why the changes are necessary. If you need to change your paper's author list, please email all necessary agreements and explanations to the handling editor.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,

Professor Nižetić

University of Split Faculty of Electrical Engineering Mechanical Engineering and Naval Architecture

Editor-in-Chief, Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects

snizetic@fesb.hr

Comments from the Editor and Reviewers:

Editor remarks:

- 1) Present similarity index (32%, iThenticate) must be reduced to not more than 20% with not more than 3% from a source,
- 2) The novelty of the work must be clearly addressed and discussed, compare your research with existing research findings and highlight novelty, (compare your work with existing research findings and highlight novelty),
- 3) Please add some quantitative data in the abstract section related to the main research outcomes,
- 4) The main objective of the work must be written on the more clear and more concise way at the end of introduction section,
- 5) Introduction section must be written on more quality way, i.e. more up-to-date references addressed. Research gap should be delivered on more clear way with directed necessity for the conducted research work,
- 6) Conclusion section is missing some perspective related to the future research work, quantify main research findings,
- 7) English language should be carefully checked and carefully check paper for language typos,
- 8) Any authorship changes will need to have a specific, valid reason for the update that will be evaluated by the Editor according to journal defining authorship guidelines.

Reviewer: 1

Comments to the Author

The authors investigated porous carbon, prepared by chemical activation of biowaste, for the application of supercapacitors. The obtained materials showed a 3D nano-architecture with oxygen doping. The electrodes exhibit satisfactory capacitive performance. The author suggested that functional groups participated in the faraday reaction, thus improving the redox behavior of the electrode. I would recommend it for further consideration. A few suggestions for the authors are below.

- 1) The pyrolysis mechanisms are not provided in the manuscript. It is not clear how precursors are reacting to KOH. Corresponding references need to be provided.
- 2) Mass loading of the electrode needs to be given in the experimental part. The specific capacitance of obtained materials should be benchmarked with recent studies.
- 3) Areal capacitance is important for hybrid devices. The correlation between gravimetric and areal capacitance should be addressed.
- 4) Fig. 6b, CV tests were performed in different ranges. Please explain.
- 5) Supercapacitors based on activated carbon are known to suffer from voltage leakage. Please present charge retentions of fabricated devices.

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author

The author reported using jackfruit leaf waste as a biowaste source to prepare a three-dimensional (3D) interconnected porous carbon framework self-doped with oxygen by KOH impregnation, carbonization, and activation under a CO₂ atmosphere. The as-prepared porous carbon possesses good electrochemical performance. The author should make the following modifications

1. The supercapacitor is characterized by high power density, so the author should test higher scanning rate.
 2. Recent reports in relevant fields should be cited, such as, *Journal of Energy Storage* 49 (2022) 104122; *Microporous and Mesoporous Materials* 310 (2021) 110659; *Chemical Engineering Journal* 384 (2020) 123263
-



Universitas Hasanuddin

230456671.R1 (Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects) A revise decision has been made on your submission

4 messages

Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects

Fri, Apr 28, 2023 at

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

2:53 PM

Reply-To: snizetic@fesb.hr

To: arung-lolo@fmipa.unhas.ac.id

28-Apr-2023

Dear Dr Bidayatul Armynah:

Your manuscript entitled "Biowaste-derived oxygen-self-doped three-dimensional interconnected porous carbon for electrochemical supercapacitor applications" which you submitted to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects, has been reviewed. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewer(s) would like to see some revisions made to your manuscript before publication. Therefore, I invite you to respond to the reviewer(s)' comments and revise your manuscript.

When you revise your manuscript please highlight the changes you make in the manuscript by using the track changes mode in MS Word or by using bold or colored text.

In accordance with our format-free submission policy, an editable version of the article must be supplied at the revision stage. Please submit your revised manuscript files in an editable file format.

When you submit your revision, please also provide your response to the reviewer comments as a separate "Supplementary Material - for review" source file.

To submit a revision, go to <https://rp.tandfonline.com/submission/flow?submissionId=230456671.R1&step=1>. If you decide to revise the work, please submit a list of changes or a rebuttal against each point which is being raised when you submit the revised manuscript.

If you have any questions or technical issues, please contact the journal's editorial office at ueso-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects, your revised manuscript should be uploaded as soon by 26-Aug-2023.

Please contact our editorial office at ueso-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk if you are in need of an extension.

Changing the author list for a revision is rare and requires two criteria be met. First, every author being added or removed must provide their agreement for the change. Second, each author who is being added must also explain why they meet the definition of authorship for this paper in detail and elaborate on specific areas of the research they contributed to. This definition is given at <https://authorservices.taylorandfrancis.com/defining-authorship/>. Any requested changes in the order of the author list also require the agreement of all authors and an explanation of why the changes are necessary. If you need to change your paper's author list, please email all necessary agreements and explanations to the handling editor.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,

Professor Nižetić

University of Split Faculty of Electrical Engineering Mechanical Engineering and Naval Architecture

Editor-in-Chief, Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects

snizetic@fesb.hr

Comments from the Editor and Reviewers:

Editor remarks:

- 1) Present similarity index (26%, iThenticate) must be reduced to not more than 20% with not more than 3% from a source,
- 2) Please don't use lumpy reference (such as: Hor & Hashmi, 2020; Y. Liang et al., 2022; Yanilmaz et al., 2019). Each reference needs to be properly addressed. Please revise your paper accordingly since same issue occurs on several spots in the paper.

Reviewer: 2

Comments to the Author

1. Block references, e.g. ((Z. Liu et al., 2020; Nanda et al., 2022; P. Xu et al., 2022), are not allowed by journal policy. Each reference must be elaborated separately. Exceptionally, citation is allowed max 2 references in one block.
 2. Introduction section - state the novelties of the paper in relation to the cited references and the current state of the literature. This is a very important item.
 3. Write the Conclusion section in bullet-form to highlight the novelties and main contributions of the paper.
-



Universitas Hasanuddin

Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects - Decision on Manuscript ID UESO-2023-0362.R2

1 message

Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects

Sat, May 13, 2023 at

<onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

2:58 PM

Reply-To: snizetic@fesb.hr

To: arung-lolo@fmipa.unhas.ac.id

13-May-2023

Dear Dr Armynah:

Ref: Biowaste-derived oxygen-self-doped three-dimensional interconnected porous carbon for electrochemical supercapacitor applications

Our referees have now considered your paper and have recommended publication in Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects. We are pleased to accept your paper in its current form which will now be forwarded to the publisher for copy editing and typesetting. The reviewer comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

You will receive proofs for checking, and instructions for transfer of copyright in due course.

The publisher also requests that proofs are checked and returned within 48 hours of receipt.

Thank you for your contribution to Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects and we look forward to receiving further submissions from you.

Sincerely,

Professor Nižetić

University of Split Faculty of Electrical Engineering Mechanical Engineering and Naval Architecture

Editor-in-Chief, Energy Sources, Part A: Recovery, Utilization, and Environmental Effects

snizetic@fesb.hr